

20132 Pacific Coast Highway Malibu, CA 90265 310-456-1475

To the L.A. Board of Supervisors Kenneth Hahn Hall of Administration 500 West Temple Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

August 31, 2008

Regarding CUP # 200700020/Project No. R2006-03164-(2) - CVS/T-Mobile

**Dear Supervisors:** 

My name is Donna Bohana. I grew up in Baldwin Hills and currently have family in View Park where the proposed cell antenna facility will be placed. I have been in real estate for over 14 years with Coldwell Banker and now own my own company. I must express my professional opinion and a sincere concern for the community in its entirety.

The greatest concern to my clients, as well as others in the neighborhood is this placement of such a telecommunications facility will affect how some potential future buyers of homes in this neighborhood would view this as an obstacle and ultimately affect the salability of these homes by diminishing the buyer pool. It is therefore my opinion based on my experience that the presence of this facility in this location will have a substantial negative effect on the property values of the surrounding properties.

As a realtor, I must disclose to potential buyers where there are cell antennas nearby. I have found in my own experience that there is a very real stigma and cellular facilities near homes are perceived as undesirable.

This is an established neighborhood with a tremendous sense of community. It is my hope that you will recognize that this possible addition will impact a residential neighborhood in many ways.

Sincerely,

Donna Bohana - President/Realtor

March 26, 2008

Hall of Records Los Angeles County Regional Planning Board (13th Floor) 320 West Temple Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Re: Conditional Use Permit - T-Mobile/CVS Case # 200700020/Project No. R2006-03164-(2)

## To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing to oppose the construction of the T-Mobile facility with nine cell phone antennas on the rooftop of CVS Pharmacy at Slauson and Overhill.

Lam very familiar with the homes and Real Estate market in this area and more specifically the area of Windsor Hills and View Park as both a resident and a realtor. own a Real Estate office on the corner of Slauson and Overhill and have sold many properties in Windsor Hills, View Park, surrounding areas and throughout all of Los Angeles over the past 40 years.

I am also very familiar with the impact that nearby telecommunications antenna or facility may have on a home's marketability. Based on my experience, I believe the installation of the proposed facility at CVS will have an immediate and adverse impact on the surrounding neighborhood. Those who would otherwise purchase a home, now considered desirable, can be deterred by a facility like the one proposed and this significantly reduces sales prices and does so immediately. The perceived health and safety risks of living near cellular facilities are of concern to many people.

As a result, I believe a facility such as the one proposed will diminish the buyer pool. significantly reduce home sales prices, after the character of the surrounding area and impair the use of the residential properties for their primary uses.

I encourage the County to work with T-Mobile on finding an alternative site and to keep sites away from residential areas.

Thank you for your time and consideration. evel Class

## The Appraisers Squad LLC COMMENT ADDENDUM

File No. 808222SI

Property Address: 5577 Onagrest Dr	
City Los Angeles Caunty Los Angeles State CA Zip Code 90	040
Lender/Client Management Portfolio Address 5577 Onacrest Dr Los Angeles CA 90043	J43

### SUBJECT PROPERTY ANALYSIS:

The subject property is a 10 room 3 bedroom 2 bathroom Single family dwelling in the Los Angeles County View Park Area of the City of Los Angeles. The subject property has been upgraded with Gustom kitchen cabinets. New Carpet, Granite kitchen counters. Landscaping and new fixtures. The overall condition of the subject property is excellent with modern amenities and fixtures, nevertheless there is an exterior condition which has negatively affected the subject which includeds the commercial building at the rear of the subject, and the recent decision which has been approved by the city of Los Angeles auty 08; 200 are condition use permit (CUD # 2007-00020) to allow for the construction operation and maintenance of awriteess telecommunication and intended the property of the construction of the property owner has listed the property on the MLS and has had a potential buyer back out of the deal once this particular information of the satellite communication cepter was appropriate the local community protests of the deal once this particular the neighborhood. This particular, community continues to protest. The appraiser is not a specialist in the field of hazardous affects and or materials, although there has been a canceled potential sale therefore it is relevant and determined that this new planning decision can have some negative affect on the subject property.

"The property owner has a potential buyer back out of the deal once it was [disclosed]. There has been a canceled potential sale therefor it is relevant and it's been determined that this ... has a negative affect on the subject property."

# THE PLACEMENT OF THE CELL TOWER WILL AFFECT **NEIGHBORHOOD VALUES**

- membership organization for appraisers with 91 chapters The Appraisal Institute is the largest global professional throughout the world.
- that a cell tower should, in fact, cause a decrease in home The Institute spotlighted the issue of cell towers and the fair market value of a home and educated its members <u>value. (www.appraisalinstitute.org)</u>
- The studies above and additional peer reviewed research 2008. If these are no longer in our file, please notify the and data were submitted to regional planning in March Community to resubmit.

Cont.

- the potential health hazards of [cellular phone towers and antennas] has spread concerns among the public, Sandy Bond, who concluded that "media attention to resulting in increased resistance" to sites near those The definitive work on this subject was done by Dr.
- higher range the closer the property. In today's market, from 2 to 20% with the percentage moving toward the Percentage decreases mentioned in the study range can we afford this?
- Recent CNN/Larry King Live poll shows 72% now believe cell technology is dangerous. Increased awareness of health risks posed by living near cell antennas lowers property values even more.

Cont.

the Windsor Hills and View Park Residents - to disclose even the potential existence of this facility when selling a home There may be a legal obligation the County is forcing onto which will erode property value – as long as the matter emains unsettled.

- affect the value or desirability of the property," including "known conditions outside of and surrounding" it. This includes "nuisances" and zoning changes that allow for sellers and licensees must disclose material facts that The California Association of Realtors maintains that commercial uses.
- We have submitted letters from realtors ALL SAYING THIS WILL AFFECT HOME VALUES



BALDWIN HILLS ESTATES HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION P.O. BOX 8897 LOS ANGELES, CA 90008-0897 (323) 292-4342

www.baldwinhillsestates.net

June 13, 2008

Los Angeles County Regional Planning Commission 320 West Temple Street, Hall of Administration, Room 150 Los Angeles, CA 90012

RE: Los Angeles County Conditional Use Permit #2007-00020, #R2006-03162-(2)

Dear Planning Commissioners:

This letter stands as notification of the strong opposition of over 4000 residents from the Baldwin Hills Estates Homeowners' Association to the T-Mobile Zoning Conditional Use Permit.

Several months ago, our residents experienced a public hearing on appeal by T-Mobile before the Los Angeles City Planning Commissioners in opposition to a request by T-Mobile for a condition use permit to install 8 unmanned telecommunications antennas on a building adjacent to residential housing within Baldwin Hills, located just up the street from the current pending CVS Pharmacy site.

hire of Fiscal impact to houses " Residents presented information to the Los Angeles City Planning Commissioners regarding the historical nature of the community, the integrity of the existing housing uniformity, the direct fiscal impact to houses within the zone of service and the option of other sites outside and away from residential communities. The commissioners found, among other things, that altering a residential community for commercial use would not be a win win. Thus, we are asking you to deny this application for similar reasons as well.

Please be advised that the Los Angeles City Zoning Administrator gave T-Mobile until 03-25-07 to meet with residents in the city of Los Angeles for an amicable resolution. However, T-Mobile decided to circumvent this decision by relocating just up the street from the original site, re-apply to the County Planning Board of Commissioners for a site now patronized by neighboring families and to increase their antennas installation from 8 to 9.

We are vehemently opposed to the T-Mobile application on file and request your support to deny the application for good cause. Again, it is our desire not to convert and/or alter our residential community to commercial use for the purposes of harboring equipment for profit by T-Mobile. Also, the Los Angeles City Planning Commissioners mentioned several area alternative sites during the hearing, and the CVS Pharmacy on file was not one of them.

I hope that you would be familiar with the concerns and issues of our community and support our request to uphold the prior decision rendered against the same applicant in a neighboring jurisdiction by the Los Angeles City Planning Commissioners.

Sincerely,

Robert Cole

Robert Cole - President, Baldwin Hills Estates Homeowners' Association

# UNITED HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION

P.O. BOX 43338 LOS ANGELES, CA 90043

March 17, 2008

Los Angeles County Dept. of Regional Planning 320 West Temple Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Re: Conditional Use Permit - Case # 200700020/Project NO. R2006-O3164-(2) 4501 West Slauson Avenue

Dear Regional Planning Board and Zoning Administrator,

The United Homeowners Association (UHA) represents approximately 5000 households in the Windsor Hills, View Park and View Heights communities as well as those portions of the unincorporated Los Angeles County area abutting the City of Inglewood to the north and east. Since the early 1970s, UHA has worked to maintain property values, increase the quality of life and preserve these and surrounding communities. As part of our conservation and preservation efforts, we have worked closely with City and County officials and neighboring cities to address issues of aesthetics, as well as visual and economic blight.

We respectfully request that you **DENY** the Conditional Use Permit 200700020/Project NO. R2006-O3164-(2) to preserve and protect the property values, safety and peace of mind for homeowners in the area.

A cell facility of this magnitude (9 antennas) approximately 50 feet away from a home and across the street from a Nursery School will be precedent-setting and open the door for other cell carriers to have similar facilities easily approved throughout our community. Further, this facility will lower property values of the single family homes in this residential community. Residents would seek lower tax assessments as a result of this installation. There are various appraiser journals and industry publications that confirm that cell phone antennas reduce property values and adversely affect house sales. Many nearby residents are prepared to sell in an already depressed market or, in the case of one new resident with little to no equity, simply walk away if these antennas are installed.

See, e.g., Sandy Bond, PhD and Ko-Kang Wang,, "The Impact of Cell Phone Towers on House Prices in Residential Neighborhoods," The Appraisal Journal (Summer 2005): 256-277 (both a survey examining residents' perception of living near cellular phone base stations (CPBS) and a market sales study analyzing actual property sales data found that CPBS have a negative impact on the prices of houses in the study areas). See also Sandy Bond, PhD, "The Effect of Distance to Cell Phone Towers on House Prices in Florida," The Appraisal Journal (Fall 2007): 362-370.

Local government control of land use, i.e. zoning, in the United States dates back to 1916. A 1926 Supreme Court decision, Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co., reinforces the principle that the single-family residential use is at the top of the hierarchy of land uses to be protected by zoning regulations. Zoning regulations are written to implement municipal planning priorities whose purpose is to mitigate negative externalities that one real estate owner's use could impose on other members of the community.<sup>2</sup>

The local government officials of Los Angeles County must not leave it up to cellular site developers or personal wireless services providers to interpret the requirements of the Telecommunications Act (TCA) of 1996. There is an ample record from California State and federal appeals courts and from professional real estate appraisers and agents to justify denying permits for inappropriate antenna site proposals. Denying a specific permit does not equal denying wireless service. Local zoning authority has not been removed by the language of the TCA of 1996. See MetroPCS v. City and County of San Francisco, 400 F.3d 715 (9th Cir. 2005); see also San Diego Gas & Electric Co. v. Daley, 205 Cal. App. 3d 1334, 1349 (1988) ("The trial court here was correct in its analysis and determination that the truth or lack of truth in whether electromagnetic projections caused a health hazard . . . was immaterial. Rather the question was whether the fear of the danger existed and would affect market value").

UHA STRONGLY OPPOSES the approval for the conditional use permit being requested at 4501 West Slauson Avenue and urges Los Angeles County Regional Planning and Zoning Officials to overturn the decision of the hearing officer to approve the application filed under Case # 200700020/Project NO. R2006-O3164-(2). By denying the installation at Slauson and Overhill, the County of Los Angeles will be protecting our community from future economic blight and blighted home sales as a result of inappropriate placement and, at the same time, ensure the health, safety and well being of the community as we seek to examine the potential impacts of this new and rapidly growing technology.

Thank you for support in this very important matter.

ONL

Theodore Irving

**PRESIDENT** 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Carol C. McDonough, "The Price of Zoning Revisited: Zoning Issues Raised by the Telecommunications Act of 1996," *Illinois Real Estate Letter*, Winter 1999, p.1, Office of Real Estate Research, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

Windsor Hills Block Club Windsor Hills, CA 90043

March 20, 2008

To: Los Angeles County Department of Regional Planning

Re: Conditional Use Permit - Case # 200700020/Project No. R2006-03164-(2)

To Whom It May Concern:

Windsor Hills Block Club (WHBC) represents over 200 homes in the area of Windsor Hills and was created for the purposes of reinstating our neighborhood watch and to build a strong community alliance that will empower us to effectively address and resolve issues that impact our community.

We held a community meeting (with approximately 80 in attendance) on March 15th 2008 to carefully consider the pros and cons of the proposed T-Mobile cellular facility at CVS on the corner of Slauson and Overhill and to take a vote on whether to support or oppose this project. In a unanimous decision WHBC voted to **OPPOSE** the T-Mobile facility.

On behalf of WHBC I am writing today to respectfully request you overturn the decision of the hearing officer, January 8th, 2008, regarding the conditional use permit to authorize construction, operation and maintenance of an unmanned wireless telecommunications facility consisting of 9 antennas and 6 BTS equipment cabinets on the roof of an existing CVS Pharmacy at 4501 West Slauson Avenue.

Many in our community have expressed concerns over the negative impact that would be caused by such an installation of this cellular facility on the roof of CVS and residents are growing increasingly vocal in their objections. The psychological impact can adversely affect the marketability of nearby business in the same way that union picketing reduces the value of the stock in large companies involved in hostile labor negotiations. And this is what we are facing with growing numbers wishing to boycott the CVS pharmacy and owner of the property, Alexander Haagen.

Residents are most concerned that this cellular facility will lower the property values of our homes. In some instances, it will also impact the views our neighbors currently enjoy from their residences. Based on their professional experience, Real Estate brokers and agents recognize that the presence of a nearby cell tower brings on a definite and ultimate decline in the potential buyers pool for homes in the vicinity. They point out that allowing construction of a cell facility which is a commercial/industrial use in or near a designated residential zone alters the character and aesthetics of the surrounding area. They have stated that this shrinking of the buyer pool can translate to a loss of 30 to 50% in the value of a home. Some homes in this situation are impossible for agents to sell.

The proposed facility does not conform to the area's historic and cultural element. Windsor Hills was originally designed as a "fashionable" residential district with specific intent of banning businesses that generated a "noxious" influence upon the surrounding residential area. See attached document regarding deeded prohibitions extended to 57 business classifications (and over 80 sub-classifications) in total. Adding rooftop antennas visible from the street will have a negative impact on the marketability of the property and surrounding properties who are always concerned with the image the

# WHBC

# Participating in Neighborhood Excellence

Windsor Hills Block Club Windsor Hills, CA 90043

property conveys to passersby. It would forever alter the character of our neighborhood and simply doesn't fit directly across the street from a Nursery School, Health Food Store, above a drug store and immediately adjacent single family homes.

In addition, there are many safety issues that have not been thoroughly examined and serious potential health and environmental impacts of rooftop antennas at close range which require fences, signage and other mechanisms to prevent one from injury. For these reasons Courts have also recognized that communities can deny antennas where "it is not unreasonably discriminatory to deny a subsequent application for a cell site that is substantially more intrusive than existing cell sites by virtue of its structure, placement or cumulative impact." The "least intrusive manner" takes into consideration the adverse impacts of the development on the character of the neighborhood in which the site is found, and the potential for property devaluation of the adjoining landowners.

We do not want cellular antennas placed close to homes or schools and believe this is not about providing us a service but more for the market share of one company. Many of us are already satisfied with the existing cellular coverage in the area and/or have land lines. Those who want improved cellular coverage are not willing to obtain it at the cost of our property values or other associated risks.

Please help us to preserve and protect our property values, safety and peace of mind and the continued support of nearby businesses by denying a Conditional Use Permit—Case # 200700020/Project No. R2006-03164-(2) 4501 West Slauson Avenue.

On behalf of the residents of Windsor Hills, we thank you for your consideration and hopefully cooperation.

Toni Mc Donald-Tabor

President

Windsor Hills Block Club

Harold Anderson

Vice-President

Windsor Hills Block Club